

Six Roles of Philanthropy in John D. Rockefeller, Jr.'s Response to the 1913-14 Colorado Coal Strike

by Kirk Hallahan

Professor Emeritus, Colorado State University



© 2023 by Kirk Hallahan



Abstract

John D. Rockefeller, Jr.'s understanding of labor issues prior to 1914 was shaped largely through his philanthropic and civic activities, including contributions to five liberal, Progressive-era organizations concerned with improving industrial conditions. Simply put, philanthropy provided his education.

Following the tragic events in Colorado, especially the so-called Ludlow Massacre, JDR Jr. employed philanthropic giving, in combination with a variety of other strategies, to address the problems at the Colorado Fuel & Iron Company (CF&I), while also restoring the Rockefeller family's good name: He used philanthropy to:

- Improve social and economic conditions in Colorado immediately following the strike;
- Involve the YMCA's industrial department as part of the company's expanded employee welfare programs;
- Express gratitude and demonstrate camaraderie with CF&I employees following his historic 1915 visit to Colorado;
- Promote the ideas of employee representation and personal relations in business; and
- Encourage research in the emerging fields of industrial relations and organizational behavior.

This research report highlights philanthropic aspects of JDR Jr.'s response to the strike and are based on a larger investigation that examined JDR Jr.'s efforts as milestone events in modern public relations and industrial relations as well as JDR Jr.'s emergence as a 20th century icon. Observations about his philanthropic strategy are discussed.

John D. Rockefeller, Jr. was one of the most notable and highly regarded philanthropists of the 20th century. However, early in his career, soon after the Rockefeller Foundation was launched in 1913, he and his family were thrust into controversy as part of the bitter 1913-14 strike against the coal mine operators of Colorado.

On April 20, 1914, a bloody skirmish broke out between striking miners and mine guards, accompanied by state militia, as gunfire and a fire engulfed the miners' tent colony in Ludlow, Colorado. The incident triggered sensationalized coverage throughout the country wherein the Rockefellers were vilified as absentee owners of the Colorado Fuel and Iron Company, even though they were investors who only owned 40% of the company's common and preferred shares.¹ Moreover, the strident strikers and strike-sympathizers seized upon the incident, which they quickly labeled the "Ludlow Massacre," to blame the Rockefellers for the entire strike, for the violence, for the miserable conditions in the coal camps, and, most of all, for the deaths of the innocent thirteen women and children who had hidden below ground to escape the bullets, only to be smothered in the fire.²

Rockefeller spent much of the next decade responding to the incident. Publicist Ivy Lee circulated more than a dozen printed bulletins to opinion leaders across the country to explain the coal operators' side of the strike.³ JDR Jr. testified before a Congressional committee,⁴ appeared twice before an already-extant but hostile federal commission studying industrial problems,⁵ and paid two personal visits to Colorado.⁶ Guided by labor advisor William Lyon Mackenzie King,⁷ he pressed company officials to improve working conditions and led the creation of an employee representation plan, fashioned by King, to give workers a greater voice in the workplace.⁸ Later, he publicly promoted the importance of personal relations in industry through speeches and articles that were compiled into a book.⁹

Philanthropy was an integral – sometimes overlooked – component of his response. Beginning when he joined his father's office in 1897 upon graduation from Brown University, JDR Jr. assumed increasing responsibility for

managing his father's investments as well as philanthropic giving. Over the eighteen years that ensued, he was integrally involved in the creation of the General Education Board, the Rockefeller Sanitary Commission for the Eradication of Hookworm Disease, and the Rockefeller Foundation. He became a philanthropist in his own right; thus it was only natural that contributions became a part of the mix of solutions he pursued.

Philanthropy as Education: Learning about Labor Issues

Many accounts – then and now -- falsely portray JDR Jr. in the stereotyped public image of JDR Sr. at the time – as a robber-baron, absentee owner of oil and other companies, who was only concerned about profits and knew nothing about labor.¹⁰ However, JDR Jr. was never driven by profit for profit's sake. In the case of CF&I, his goal had always been simply to preserve the company's value in order to sell (without taking a loss) the family's investment, which had been made in 1903 merely as a favor to railroad heir George Gould.¹¹

When the Colorado coal strike broke out in 1913, the Rockefellers had not previously been involved in a labor dispute, which might have provided better insights about JDR Jr.'s views about labor relations. Nonetheless, documents from the first decade of the 1900s suggest that JDR Jr. clearly was conscious of labor problems. Indeed, he brokered or led the family's financial support of at least five liberal Progressive Era organizations devoted to labor reform.

The earliest of these was headed by Rev. Josiah Strong, a leading proponent of the Social Gospel movement, to which JDR Jr.'s Baptist family ascribed. In 1898, Strong created the League for Social Service as a clearinghouse of information about social betterment programs and especially *industrial betterment*. Strong was later credited for launching the "Safety First" movement dedicated to reducing workplace accidents. Between 1899 and 1901, the Rockefellers made four modest contributions to the start-up organization, which quickly adopted the name American Institute for Social Service (AISS).¹²

Perhaps the most significant contribution was a \$10,000 gift to the International Committee of the YMCA to establish YMCA programs within manufacturing and industrial concerns, similar to those that had operated on railroads since 1872. The Y's general secretary promised the Rockefellers "with certainty" that other employers and employees would experience the same satisfaction and benefits -- and that "very unusual returns" would accrue. Without commenting on the proposal's merits in his transmittal letter, JDR Jr. simply stated the funds were for the Y's "general work as your committee may think best."¹³

The Rockefellers also supported labor reform through their membership in the National Civic Federation (NCF), founded in 1900. The NCF's purposes were to promote social efficiency and moderate social reforms by improving cooperation among business, labor, and consumer advocates. While the AISS mostly relied on curating and redistributing information, the NCF produced its own educational materials, sponsored conferences, and offered a consulting service. The NCF also sought uniform state laws related to child labor, workers' compensation, and factory safety.¹⁴

Two other groups to which the Rockefellers contributed were the National Child Labor Committee, the organization most responsible for establishing child labor laws in various states during the period from 1907 to 1915.¹⁵ Also, for four years from 1911 through 1914, the Rockefellers contributed \$1,000 annually to the American Association for Labor Legislation (AALL), an organization of academic economists that became a leading advocate for workers' compensation, occupational health and safety protections, and curbs on child labor. The AALL made its case on moral grounds as well as economic benefits to employees and employers.¹⁶

Although all these gifts were modest in size, JDR Jr. and the office staff scrutinized all requests carefully. Not surprisingly, after his unsuccessful efforts to persuade J.P. Morgan and others in 1912 about the importance of research in their proposed campaign to educate the public about free enterprise and

property rights, JDR Jr. envisioned a role for the newly created Rockefeller Foundation to investigate economic issues, including labor problems. In March 1914 – while the Colorado strike was in its sixth month and a month before Ludlow – the Foundation’s trustees, at JDR Jr.’s behest, authorized a group of economists to develop a proposal for an Institute for Economic Research.¹⁷

Philanthropy as Remedy: Improving Social and Economic Conditions in Colorado

In the aftermath of Ludlow and the negative publicity heaped upon the family, JDR Jr. was deluged with recommendations about how to respond. Among the most notable suggestions was an appeal from clergyman Howard H. Russell to support efforts of the Anti-Saloon League of Colorado. JDR Jr. had always doubted whether state-imposed prohibitions were effective in squelching the evils of intemperance, but decided to contribute \$10,000 toward the effort in Colorado. In transmitting a check for the first installment, JDR Jr. explained that he had been advised that such an effort in a mining district would be most effective than in large cities.¹⁸

Requests for assistance from individual members of the public also arrived at the Rockefeller office at 26 Broadway.¹⁹ Although he responded favorably to only a few, one of the earliest requests came from the parents of a mine guard who described the financial and psychological trauma they had incurred in securing the body of their slain son for burial. Even though their son was not a CF&I employee, JDR Jr. was moved to send the family \$450 and a sympathetic letter extolling their son’s courage and patriotism.

When the strike ended in December 1914, the miners, their union, and the Colorado economy were all in dreadful condition. News about the destitute conditions began to circulate nationally, prompting JDR Jr. to query company officials. Early on, he had advised the company “to do nothing which will relieve the labor organization of carrying to the fullest extent possible the burden which

properly belongs to it and which it has publicly announced that it proposed to carry.”²⁰

JDR Jr. showed continued but cautious concern until he received a telegram saying that a committee of miners at a meeting in Trinidad had voted to ask JDR Jr. (and others) for help. In part, the message read, in reference to the 1914 European relief efforts by the Rockefeller Foundation, “You have been liberal in your assistance to starving Belgians. Why not aid the starving miners in Colorado and their wives and children? Conditions are desperate. Miners want work or bread.”²¹

Rockefeller and his staff deliberated. JDR Jr. was inclined to only help former CF&I employees in distress, and later said he would help meet the needs of former employees out of his own pocket. However, adviser Mackenzie King quickly recognized the opportunity to make a meaningful contribution. Based on a newspaper article that argued for Rockefeller to come to the aid of the needy, King persuaded Rockefeller that a very large and unrestricted gift was needed and later convinced the Rockefeller Foundation’s trustees that Colorado was an appropriate place for a relief project in the amount of \$100,000. King made three trips to Colorado on behalf of the Foundation to plan, monitor, and evaluate the project, which was carried out by county road departments under the watch of a three-person Relief Committee appointed by the governor.²²

The project was intended to both provide employment and improve important public works. About 4,000 men in the six counties were put to work and paid \$2 a day for short periods of time. About 96 miles of roads were rebuilt, and various shorter segments of four highways were constructed.

Public response was uniformly favorable. When JDR Jr. toured the improvements in September 1915, he was presented accolades for the Foundation’s generosity. In his notes dictated along the way, JDR Jr. explained he had expressed his and the Foundation’s satisfaction with being able to cooperate with a committee in a plan that was “so effective, so intelligent, and so successful in dealing with unemployment.”²³

Philanthropy as Welfare: Underwriting YMCAs at CF&I

Following the strike, JDR Jr. imposed a number of changes at CF&I. He replaced chief executive Lamont Bowers by promoting Jesse F. Welborn. He also recruited a seasoned industrial relations expert to join CF&I's staff and implemented the Colorado Industrial Plan, which outlined progressive labor practices and improved working and living conditions.

The Rockefellers hitherto had always delegated responsibility for day-to-day operations of their investments to local managers, and had not intertwined their beneficences with their investments. However, as part of his effort, JDR Jr. decided to personally cover the costs for the YMCA Industrial Department to establish small clubs in the company's mine camps and later a large facility at its steel mill in Pueblo.

In June 1915, six months after the end of the strike and on the heels of being grilled for the third time in public proceedings, JDR Jr. received an unsolicited proposal from YMCA officials in New York to conduct a feasibility study and establish an industrial department in Colorado. JDR Jr. agreed to cooperate in the study, which reported promising prospects. Importantly, the Y's recommendations suggested, "The Company should recognize this work not as philanthropy ... but as a proper item in the cost of operation."²⁴

The Y's involvement was virtually assured with the hiring of labor expert Clarence J. Hicks, a former YMCA executive, in summer 1915.²⁵ When Hicks formally recommended plans to involve the YMCA in September, JDR Jr., his advisors, and Welborn all concurred with the idea. However, a debate ensued about how the company should pay for the salary of the executive secretary, or whether the salary should be paid out of general Y funds. Hicks, based on his prior experience, pressed for direct underwriting and suggested the Y should sign a contract with the company. King argued that paying for the secretary from Y funds removed appearances that the company was trying to make policy

or impose conditions. It was finally decided that the Rockefellers would increase their existing grants to the Y general fund, and that it be understood that the funds would be transferred without any exchange of letters.²⁶

By April 1916, nine associations had been created in the mine camps. Several operated in shuttered saloons that had been closed following passage of statewide Prohibition; others were domiciled in existing clubhouses. The Y's involvement, which was jump-started by JDR Jr., led to the remodeling of four clubhouses and the construction of seven others by the company. When A. Bruce Minear was hired to supervise the Y's work in the Colorado mines, the inquisitive Rockefeller wrote Hicks wanting all the details about new secretary's qualifications.²⁷

The idea for a YMCA at CF&I's steel mill, which had been included in the YMCA's original proposal, but wasn't considered seriously until an employee expressed the hope that JDR Jr. would be interested in funding such a club. His remark was made at one of the first joint employer-employee meetings conducted as part of the Colorado Industrial Plan. Hicks reported the employees' interest to Rockefeller, who eventually agreed and previewed plans for the facility when he made a second trip to Colorado in 1918. The Steel Works Club, Minnequa Branch of YMCA opened in February 1920 – and was a sizeable building designed to serve 5,000 employees. ²⁸

JDR Jr. initially questioned whether the family should underwrite the entire building, but agreed to pay half. The remainder would be raised from the community and company. JDR Jr.'s letter to his father signaled a shift in the family's philanthropic philosophy:

I believe the time has come when we should change our former policy and contribute to the activities for the moral, social and religious betterment of the people who are related to us through our investments, whose claim is less direct. I unhesitatingly recommend that you make this contribution.

John D. Rockefeller, Sr., as he so often did, admonished his son to “... weigh the matter very carefully, and in all aspects....” The senior Rockefeller agreed to contribute \$100,000, and JDR Jr. added \$50,000 of his own money. As a company director, he suggested to Welborn a contribution of \$75,000-\$100,000 from the company would be acceptable if justified by the managers (but was clearly expected).²⁹ The YMCA contracted to manage the clubhouses in the CF&I camps until 1922. The YMCA at the steel plant operated until 1950.

Philanthropy as Gratitude and Camaraderie: Personal Gifts to the Mine Communities

In September 1915, JDR Jr. made an historic trip to Colorado, which more than any other action helped reverse negative public opinion about the family, especially in Colorado and New York. Rockefeller’s every move was detailed for readers of mainstream newspapers, which depicted Rockefeller as a warm, friendly, ordinary guy -- a Baptist who waltzed with every miner’s wife one evening at a camp dance.³⁰

When JDR Jr. toured the camps, he had a chance to get a taste of the miners’ daily lives. In Primero, for example, he attended the moving picture show held at the local school. During the intermission, he served as the guest presenter of the prizes for the company-sponsored contest for the best home garden. In the same overnight stay, JDR Jr. learned that the camp’s band was eager to have a bandstand in a central portion of town, where the company had promised to build a little park. In a moment of spontaneous largess, after only briefly consulting with a company official, Rockefeller told the band’s leader he would be glad to donate the bandstand as an expression of his appreciation for the hospitality he had received.

Several days later, JDR Jr. addressed the community at Cameron and made a similar offer as part of the park being constructed. Later, a committee of young men came to him and asked if the bandstand could be enlarged into an open dancing pavilion. JDR Jr. deferred to local officials and said he would be glad

to do whatever they agreed upon. He good-heartedly quipped, “I’m afraid you people out here will think I carry band stands around in my grip, and am trying to get rid of them. However, we ought to have a band stand here — we citizens of Cameron — and when I come out next year that stand will be all finished and then your splendid band can give outdoor concerts.”³¹ In all, JDR Jr. funded four bandstands, along with band uniforms.

In making his proposal earlier, Clarence Hicks suggested \$30,000 be allocated for an additional ten or twelve churches in the mine camps. Without hesitation, the devout Rockefeller said he would pay for these out of his own pocket. (A possible concern was the company needed to avoid religious controversies — similar to those about undue influence exerted by CF&I officials who served on local school boards.) Communities would be guaranteed the right to develop congregations, which themselves would ask for a building.³²

On his visit, JDR Jr. observed that religious services were conducted in a variety of venues, including saloons and a blacksmith shop, because of the absence of churches. Upon his return to New York, JDR Jr. explained in a letter to Mackenzie King, “My thought has been that I would be willing to cooperate with others in building churches, where a sufficient number of people are interested to ensure permanence of worship and support of the work.” In turn, King wholeheartedly endorsed the idea and opined that any gifts he made should be entirely on his own, observing “The interest and loyalty and support of employees will not, in my mind be fostered to the same extent by a contribution from you that is merged in something the company is responsible.”

In all, JDR Jr. helped construct or renovate six community churches in mine camps, contributing \$13,050 between 1916 and 1920. Reflecting the immigrant make-up of camp residents, three requests came from Catholic parishes in Berwind, Rouse/Lester, and Morley. (He also contributed \$500 for an automobile used by a Catholic priest who traveled among the camps.) Three other buildings were provided to Protestant congregations, including Primero and Rouse-Lester, and the Black congregation in Rouse affiliated with the Methodist-Episcopal Conference. In each case, JDR Jr.’s initial commitments

were made in tandem with local fundraising efforts. However, JDR Jr. or CF&I made up for fundraising shortfalls or cost overruns in several instances. Later, as one of his last direct involvements with CF&I, in 1924, JDR Jr. contributed \$4,000 toward construction of the Russian-Serbian Catholic Church in Pueblo – the seventh church he helped fund.³³

Although he avoided direct control over the work, JDR Jr. took special interest in the design of each church, carefully reviewing plans and exchanging correspondence with the supervising company official. When the first church was being designed, he opined the design should be simple and appropriate for the location, but should be the dominant structure in each camp in terms of location and architectural treatment, thus exerting an “unconscious uplifting influence.” Mackenzie King had suggested that the design should be aesthetically pleasing and ought to include a small bell tower — because a bell was a pleasant contrast to a mine whistle.³⁴

JDR Jr. believed that the company had a responsibility to expend funds for both productive (revenue-generating) investments and nonproductive improvements that created only indirect returns. He wrote CF&I President Welborn that expenditures such as churches, schools, clubhouses, streets, fencing, grading were justified as business expenses “as insurance against industrial disturbances without taking into consideration the humanitarian sentiment that should impel any company to consider their introduction” In fall 1915, he also admonished Welborn that he believed the company could expend an additional \$100,000 per annum on improving working conditions.³⁵

An exception to this philosophy – and to the original plans -- was his decision to pay personally for two medical dispensaries at the coal camp at Primero and CF&I’s iron ore mine at Sunrise, Wyoming, as well as the salary of a new nurse. (Employees paid only a token premium and received full medical care for no additional cost through the company’s medical department, which operated its own hospital in Pueblo.)

In the group's planning session, Welborn expressed interest in possibly building ten emergency hospitals in the camps, but no action was taken. While on his tour later in the month, JDR Jr. interviewed CF&I's medical director, Dr. Richard W. Corwin,³⁶ as well as most camp medical staff. The doctors were divided in their views about the need for improved facilities; several doctors said they treated patients in the miners' homes. Thus, the original plan to build emergency hospitals in every camp was scaled back to include two locales where the need was deemed greatest. JDR Jr.'s generosity was fully consistent with the family's longtime philanthropic support of health care and medical research. Similar to the mine camp churches, JDR Jr. took a keen interest in making the dispensaries attractive edifices for miners and their families. For example, he suggested that a tile roof be added to the design in Primero at an additional \$200 cost.³⁷

Philanthropy as Advocacy: Promoting Personal Relations in Business

Through his speeches and articles in the years 1916 to 1919, JDR Jr. became a highly visible advocate for the principles underlying the reforms at CF&I. Most notably, he garnered accolades as a leading public interest member at President Woodrow Wilson's First Industrial Conference in 1919. Although not a member, he also exerted considerable influence over appointees to the Second Industrial Conference in 1920, where his idea of employee representation (but also collective bargaining) gained its first official governmental endorsement as a way to avoid industrial disputes.³⁸ The action helped propel the "company union" movement during the 1920s.

In 1920, JDR Jr. also began making a series of non-philanthropic and philanthropic contributions to organizations that either promoted improved labor relations or conducted research about labor matters. Among these initiatives, JDR Jr. contributed \$5,700 to a committee organized by Charles A. Coffin of General Electric to support the efforts of Sherman Rogers (né Carl Van

Hemert) who wrote magazine magazines and lectured around the country about Americanism (versus Bolshevism) and the idea of employee representation.³⁹

During the early 1920s, a number of national business organizations sought funding from JDR Jr. to conduct investigations or otherwise improve labor relations. Among these was a newly created National Bureau of Economic Research led by professors Edwin F. Gay and W.C. Mitchell. Both men had been among those who in 1914 had conferred with JDR Jr. and his staff about creating a similar organization under the auspices of the Rockefeller Foundation. Although he was inclined to give more, he contributed only \$1,000 upon the advice of his new attorney and longtime colleague, Raymond D. Fosdick.⁴⁰ He also contributed \$1,000 for a study on employee representation conducted by the nonprofit Bureau of Personnel Administration. However, JDR Jr. declined contributions to groups such as the Conference Board (then the National Industrial Conference Board) and to lesser-known organizations, such as the Loyal Legion of Loggers and Lumbermen, even though they were working to advance the employee representation cause.⁴¹

JDR Jr.'s constrained giving is explained in part because, in 1921, Fosdick proposed to create a unit to examine and report on industrial conditions, conduct studies on individual companies within and outside Rockefeller's circle of investments, and to recommend best policies and how they might be promoted. A group was initially established within Fosdick's law firm office and included an industrial relations specialist and management consultant. In 1926, the unit was spun off as the nation's first nonprofit consulting firm, Industrial Relations Counselors, Inc. (IRC). JDR Jr. agreed to underwrite its operations for \$125,000 plus start-up expenses in 1926 and then \$150,000 per annum for five years beginning in 1927 – a sizeable commitment. Reflecting JDR Jr.'s and Fosdick's international interests, IRC established a relationship with the International Labour Organization and operated an office in Geneva for five years, from 1927 to 1932, IRC's Geneva office (using funds already provided by JDR Jr.) supported the labor research conducted in Britain by John Henry Richardson of the University of Leeds.⁴²

Another group JDR Jr. supported was the Special Conference Committee (SCC), an informal group formed in 1919 and comprised of chief executives and industrial managers responsible for overseeing progressive labor relations programs at about a dozen of America's largest industrial concerns. SCC members had the resources to cover their individual costs of participation, but JDR Jr. made a significant indirect, in-kind contribution by providing the salary and office space for Edward S. Cowdrick, who became the SCC's executive secretary in 1923 and continued in that role until 1951, when the SCC's staff support was assumed by the IRC's staff. ⁴³

Two small but noteworthy gifts made in the spirit of JDR Jr.'s effort to promote cooperation were made in honor of Samuel Gompers, president of the American Federation of Labor -- \$400 toward a portrait of Gompers hung in the headquarters of the National Civic Federation, and \$1,000 toward publication of Gompers's memoirs. Gompers had viciously attacked JDR Jr. during the strike and his public testimony, but the two men reconciled during the period leading up to the First Industrial Conference. ⁴⁴

Philanthropy as Investigation: Support of Research in Industrial Relations

Certainly, JDR Jr.'s most important – and lasting – use of philanthropy involved jump-starting the academic study of industrial relations in the United States. As a formal field of study, industrial relations began with a program at the University of Wisconsin in 1920 and quickly spread elsewhere. JDR Jr. personally funded the start-up of programs at Princeton University and the University of Pennsylvania's Wharton School of Business, while Rockefeller philanthropies made later grants to both schools as well as to the Harvard School of Business Administration.

The Rockefellers had a long tradition of supporting academic research, beginning with JDR Sr.'s major gift to establish the University of Chicago in 1890. Not surprisingly, in August 1914, Rockefeller was attracted to Mackenzie

King as a consultant to research the industrial problems in Colorado under the aegis of the Rockefeller Foundation. King held a Ph.D. in economics from Harvard University and took a decidedly academic approach to his work, which began with a thorough literature review. A year later, following the launch of the Colorado Industrial Plan, JDR Jr. retained King as a consultant for four years, helped King to consult at major companies, and orchestrated a grant from the Rockefeller Foundation that supported King while he authored a book in 1917-1918.⁴⁵

Following King's return to Canada to assume leadership of the Liberal Party in 1920, JDR Jr. also retained two other academics – George Blessing from Swarthmore College and Robert Foerster from Harvard – to augment that research conducted by Arthur H. Lichty, a former YMCA executive, who later succeeded Clarence Hicks. Neither effort generated significant results.⁴⁶

Hicks had been hired away from CF&I after only two years to address the labor problems at Standard Oil of New Jersey's Bayonne refinery and played a pivotal role in JDR Jr.'s involvement in academia. In spring 1922, Hicks was invited to speak at Princeton University. While on a tour, Hicks observed the economics department's need for a library of materials about labor relations comparable to its collection on corporate finance. By then, Hicks had become chairman of the Special Conference Committee and was in a unique position to marshal involvement by leading corporations. Princeton officials seized the opportunity. Hicks (undoubtedly with help of Raymond Fosdick, Princeton '05) easily persuaded JDR Jr. to contribute an initial \$1,000 toward creation of a library and to pledge \$12,000 per year for 5 years (renewed in 1927 until 1930) to support Princeton's industrial relations program.⁴⁷

JDR Jr.'s support of the Wharton program came about through the efforts of another Rockefeller associate, Beardsley Ruml, director of the Laura Spelman Rockefeller Memorial (LSRM), the family's philanthropy founded in 1918 in memory of JDR Jr.'s mother. Ruml made the initial contact at Wharton as part of his efforts to assist Australian professor George Elton Mayo in locating employment in the United States. Ruml helped arrange an unfunded research

position, and then appealed to the Rockefeller Foundation, and later JDR Jr., to fund Mayo's ideas for conducting research in industrial psychology and psychiatry. JDR Jr.'s Committee on Benevolences, which had been established in 1919 to help manage the mounting number of requests being received, awarded Wharton \$3,000 to cover the first six months of Mayo's work in 1923, and \$10,000 annually for three years thereafter, plus \$1,000 for a small library. Although he had not yet conducted research in factories, Mayo had written about how worker anomie resulted from industrialization and about the need to build communication and cooperation between managers and employees. He contended industrial unrest, reverie, monotony, and fatigue could be explained by workers' psychological and social (versus financial or political) concerns. ⁴⁸

Ruml later helped Mayo secure a position at Harvard through Dean Wallace Brett Donham, a LSRM trustee, but no university funds were provided. After marshalling endorsements from IRC staff and LSRM trustee Fosdick, Ruml instructed Donham to submit a proposal to the LSRM. Within a month, Harvard received a five-year, \$60,000 grant to fund Mayo's appointment at Harvard. Despite doubts and consternation among colleagues, Mayo's appointment played a pivotal role in the evolution of the school's industrial relations research. Harvard received a \$155,000 grant from the LSRM in 1927 for an interdisciplinary research program that was already under way and involved three other faculty members. A 1931 Rockefeller Foundation five-year grant for \$875,000 (which was renewed in 1937 and extended to 1942) allowed Mayo and other faculty to expand their work. Harvard had assumed oversight from the Bell System of the historic Hawthorne studies begun in 1924 at Western Electric's telephone assembly plant outside Chicago. Mayo was responsible for interpreting the findings and made the Hawthorne studies famous – even though he never directed nor conducted them. In so doing, he became the founder of organizational behavior as a field of study and the father of the human relations movement in management.⁴⁹

Observations

JDR Jr.'s involvement in philanthropy in connection with the Colorado situation spanned four decades – a remarkable length of time. It began when the young Rockefeller worked essentially as an apprentice contributions manager in his father's office and ended by providing a leadership gift for a 1944 campaign to fund graduate fellowships at five schools with industrial relations programs that had been created with the assistance of the IRC in the 1930s. The fellowships were established to honor Clarence J. Hicks upon his retirement as IRC's chairman. The programs at Michigan, MIT, Queens College of Ontario, Stanford and CalTech were each created through local fundraising efforts that included (anonymous) leadership gifts totaling \$40,000 from JDR Jr.'s son and IRC trustee John D. Rockefeller 3rd – undoubtedly with JDR Jr.'s concurrence.⁵⁰

JDR Jr.'s benefactions are interesting for targeting a variety of audiences – Colorado residents, employees at CF&I's mine camps and steel mill, and eventually opinion leaders and academics interested in labor matters outside Colorado. What's more, he combined a several different funding sources appropriate to the circumstances – personal funds, family funds from his father, the Rockefeller Foundation, and the Laura Spelman Rockefeller Memorial. The family was not an incorporated entity, and the effort was not a corporate charitable program per se, although CF&I covered fundraising shortfalls and cost overruns for the churches and was pressed by JDR Jr. to help build the Pueblo YMCA.

Mackenzie King's initial appointment to study industrial relations problems in Colorado in the name of the Rockefeller Foundation stirred controversy and proved a watershed event in the early development of the Foundation. In January 1915, Frank P. Walsh, the pugnacious, pro-labor chair of the US Commission on Industrial Relations, accused Rockefeller of misusing the tax-exempt organization for personal gain – an allegation that took up a day of testimony in the USCIR's investigation of the Colorado strike.⁵¹ Although the

commission reached no conclusion on the matter, the Foundation's trustees later moved to distance the Foundation from the family in the public's mind, to avoid economics and other politically charged topics, and, with certain exceptions, to become primarily a funds-dispensing agency in order to free the giver and recipients of "suspicion of ulterior interest." The controversy also led Congress to pass laws to provide full funding for government programs that had been operated cooperatively with nonprofit foundations, most notably the Rockefellers' General Education Board.⁵²

Four of the roles for philanthropy identified here are forerunners of philanthropic activities common today: restoring social and economic stability following a crisis, fostering health or welfare of key audiences, promoting solutions to a particular social problem, and investigating solutions to problems through academic research.⁵³

Somewhat unusual is the proposition presented here that philanthropy provided a basis for JDR Jr.'s education about labor matters. However, as many modern-day contributions managers can attest, interactions with leaders of reform groups or nonprofit organizations are among the best ways to understand contemporary concerns and needs. Although his knowledge was not based on first-hand experience acquired by running a business, JDR Jr. might have actually possessed a better, broader-based understanding of labor concerns than if he managed an individual company with a narrow geographic or business focus – a fact ignored in most accounts.

Especially interesting was his use of personal gifts in combination in foundation giving – a luxury only afforded donors with considerable personal wealth. JDR Jr. was genuinely moved by the conditions he saw and the hospitality showed him during his 1915 visit to southern Colorado and empathized with CF&I employees. His spontaneity in offering to provide a bandstand for the Primero in mine camp was quite out of character with his normal, deliberate personality and measured approach to business matters, in general, and philanthropy, in particular.

The Rockefellers were always prudent in making contributions. In reviewing the early, modest contributions to labor reform organizations, for example, staff attorney Starr J. Murphy was watchful not to provide too large of a proportion of the organization's annual budget even though the Rockefellers could have done so easily.⁵⁴ JDR Jr.'s gift to underwrite the salary of the industrial department's Colorado executive secretary was essentially a seed grant to allow the YMCA to begin work and provided leverage to prod CF&I to construct and pay for clubhouses. By making his commitment to fund churches contingent upon local fundraising, JDR Jr. wanted to assure community support – an early form of what might be considered a challenge grant today.

Before the strike, JDR Jr. typically sought and heeded advice from his father's confidant and office manager, Frederick T. Gates, who played an instrumental role in encouraging and structuring the Rockefellers' early philanthropy and served as his mentor. Beginning with the strike, JDR Jr. relied on his own staff and advisers such as Starr J. Murphy, Foundation Secretary Jerome Greene, Mackenzie King, Ivy Lee, Raymond Fosdick, and Clarence Hicks. JDR Jr. was always conscious of his father's possible reactions and consulted him regularly, especially about larger or contributions that posed particular issues.

Perhaps most interesting, many of his philanthropic gifts in Colorado – of roads and highways through scenic byways, of churches with bell towers, of dispensaries, of bandstands as places for people to gather – were precursors of some of the most notable projects he would undertake in the decades that followed and undoubtedly lingered in his memory.⁵⁵

Although JDR Jr. was concerned with restoring the family's good name, he never touted the contributions he made.⁵⁶ Ivy Lee's bulletins focused on the strike, never mentioned the Rockefellers, and actually preceded his philanthropic response. In his speeches given between 1916 and 1919, he highlighted the progress made in Colorado (not his contributions) and focused on the ideals of employee representation and personal relations in industry. Far too unassuming, and possibly anticipating accusations of being self-serving, the

only recognition he sought was from the people whose lives were impacted -- not the public at large. To this point, he wrote in 1916:

It seems to me that in every business instance where I avail of the opportunity of cooperating with the people in any of our camps in providing of facilities for religious services, education or recreation, it is appropriate that this cooperation should be generally known, for my purpose in extending it is that there may be some tangible evidence to the people in the various camps of my personal interest in them and my desire to do what I can to make their lives brighter and happier.⁵⁷

¹ Colorado Fuel and Iron Company, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, boxes 11-26, Rockefeller Archive Center (hereafter RAC). See especially strike documents, box 19, 168-175.

² Raymond D. Fosdick, *John D. Rockefeller, Jr., A Portrait*. New York: Harper, 1956 (chapters 7-9). George S. McGovern and Leonard F. Guttridge, *The Great Coalfield War*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1972. Thomas G. Andrews, *Killing for Coal: America's Deadliest Labor War*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2008.

³ Ivy Lee and Bulletins: Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, box 22, folders 200-201, 203; box 20, folder 180, RAC. Kirk Hallahan, "Ivy Lee and the Rockefellers' Response to the 1913-1914 Colorado Coal Strike." *Journal of Public Relations Research*, vol. 13, no. 4, pp. 265-315, Fall 2002.

⁴ U.S. House of Representatives Committee on Conditions in the Coal Mines. Part X: 2841-2940 [Foster Committee]. Records: Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, boxes 21- 22, folders 196-197 and box 23, folder 28, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests Series C, box 23, folder 208, RAC.

⁵ United States Commission on Industrial Relations. *Final Report and Testimony Submitted to Congress by of the United States Commission on Industrial Relations*. 63rd. Cong. 1st Sess. Doc. 415. Vols. 2, 7-11. Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 1916. Online: <https://catalog.hathitrust.org/Record/011451867>. JDR Jr. Testimony at 8: 7761-7895 (January 1915) and 9:8592-8672 (May 1915). Correspondence: Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, boxes 23, folders 211-212. Printed materials: box 24, folder 212A. Printed testimony by JDR Jr. and others: Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, John D. Rockefeller, Personal, United States Commission on Industrial Relations (Walsh Commission), Series Z.12, RAC.

⁶ Charles O. Heydt Memo re John D. Rockefeller, Jr.'s Trip to Colorado, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, box 22, folder 198, RAC [JDR Jr.'s observations, dictated to secretary]. Newspaper clippings: box 23, folder 206; Suggestions: box 23, 209.

⁷ William Lyon Mackenzie King, [Untitled] Colorado Diary, *The Diaries of William Lyon Mackenzie King*, 1914-1915, Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa. [This separately paginated, 779-page document is inserted at page G2539]. Online: <http://www.bac-lac.gc.ca> [pages are numbered as Items 5138-5935]. Kirk Hallahan, "W.L. Mackenzie King: Rockefeller's Other Public Relations Counselor in Colorado." *Public Relations Review*, vol. 29, no. 4, pp. 401-414, 2003.

⁸ Colorado Industrial Plan: Colorado Fuel and Iron Company, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, all RAC: Letters re Working of Plan: box 12, folders 97-107; Russell Sage Foundation Evaluation: box 16, folders 134-136, RAC. Greg Patmore, "An Employer Response to Workplace Democracy...The Rockefeller Plan and the Fate of Employee Representation Plans, 1915-1935," *Rockefeller Archive Center Research Reports*, 8-14, Fall/Winter, 2001. Jonathan H. Rees, *Representation and Rebellion. The Rockefeller Plan at the Colorado Fuel and Iron Company, 1914-1942*. Boulder: University of Colorado Press, 2010. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctt46ntmw>.

⁹ Speeches: See Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, John D. Rockefeller, Jr. Personal Papers Series Z, subseries 8. See especially box 71, folders 50, 54; box 72, folders 68, 69. Articles: The first most notable article was JDR Jr., "Labor and Capital, Partners" *The Atlantic Monthly*, vol. 117, pp. 12-21, January 1916. See Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, box 13, folder 102; also box 11, folder 93 and box 12, folders 97-100. Most other articles were reprints of speeches. Book: John D. Rockefeller, Jr., *The Personal Relation in Business*. New York: Boni & Liveright, 1923.

¹⁰ Howard M. Gitelman, *Legacy of the Ludlow Massacre. A Chapter in American Industrial Relations*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1988.

¹¹ H. L. Scamehorn, *Mill and Mine: CF&I in the Twentieth Century*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1992.

¹² John D. Rockefeller, Sr. Papers, Series F, Charities Index Cards V14: Evangelical Association, RAC. AISS: Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Welfare Interests, Series P, Science and Lecture Groups-American Institute for Social Service, RAC.

¹³ International Committee of YMCA, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Welfare Interests-Youth, Series R, box 24. folder 241, RAC: Richard C. Morse to JDR Jr., November 18, 1902; JDR Jr. to Morse December 2, 1902; Morse to JDR Jr. December 3, 1902.

¹⁴ National Civic Federation: JDR Sr. Papers, Series F, Subseries V14, box 7, folder 925; Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Economic Reform Interests, Series F, box 9, folders 60-63, RAC.

¹⁵ National Child Labor Committee, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Economic Reform Interests, Series F, box 9, folders 60-63, RAC.

¹⁶ American Association for Labor Legislation, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Economic Reform Interests, Series F, box 1, folder 1, RAC.

¹⁷ Institute for Economic Research, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Economic Reform Interests, Series F, box 18, folder 143, RAC.

¹⁸ Anti-Saloon League of Colorado, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Welfare Interests – General, Series P, box 42, folder 461. Quote: JDR Jr. to Howard M. Russell, June 12, 1914, RAC.

¹⁹ Appeals for assistance: Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, box 14, folder 111, RAC.

²⁰ Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, box 20, folder 195; box 23, folder 212, RAC. Jesse F. Welborn Papers, Welborn to JDR Jr., December 24, 1914, History Colorado Archives (Colorado Historical Society), Denver.

²¹ Joe Rizzi for the Committee to JDR Jr., quoted in “Idle coal miners send frantic appeals for relief,” Trinidad, Colorado, *Chronicle News*, February 20, 1915 (from Priscilla Long Papers WH #1138, box 4, folder 26, Denver Public Library).

²² King, Colorado Diary, op. cit. pp. 255-280. Rockefeller Foundation Records, record group 3, series 900, boxes 16-20, folders 150-273, RAC. Gitelman, *Legacy of Ludlow Massacre*, op. cit., pp. 96, 102-103. Thomas A. Krainz, “Observations on John D. Rockefeller, Jr.’s and the Rockefeller Foundation’s Involvement with Colorado’s Work-Relief Program,” Rockefeller Archive Center Research Reports, 2020.
<https://rockarch.issuelab.org/resource/observations-on-john-d-rockefeller-jr-s-and-the-rockefeller-foundation-s-involvement-with-colorado-s-work-relief-program.html>.

²³ Charles O. Heydt Memo, op. cit,

²⁴ C.W. Towson Report on Mine Town Conditions, July 12, 1915, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, box 18, folders 156 and 164, RAC.

²⁵ Clarence J. Hicks, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, box 17, folders 147-148. Hicks, *My Life in Industrial Relations*, New York: Harper & Brothers, 1941.

²⁶ King, Colorado Diary, op. cit. p. 707. Welfare Work – Club Houses, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, box 17, folder 150, RAC.

²⁷ JDR Jr. to Clarence Hicks, January 16, 1916, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, box 18, RAC.

²⁸ Minutes of Joint Conference, January 26, 1916, pp. 5-6, CF&I Archives, RG 2, Steelworks Center of the West, Pueblo, Colorado. Jonathan Rees, “What If a Company Union Wasn't a

'Sham'?' The Rockefeller Plan in Action." *Labor History*, vol. 48, no. 4, pp. 457-475, November 2007.

²⁹ The gift was driven by JDR Jr.'s long-time allegiance to the Y and given against the advice of Mackenzie King. The Y was later criticized for its religious partisanship and policies that favored members. See Rees, *Representation and Rebellion*...., pp. 74-78; Gitelman, *Legacy of the Ludlow Massacre*, p. 279.

³⁰ Charles O. Heydt Memo, op. cit. p. 40. Fred McGregor, *The Fall and Rise of Mackenzie King*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1962, pp. 179-180. "J.D. gay as boy at miners' dance," *New York Sun*, September 25, 1915.

³¹ Charles O. Heydt Memo, op. cit., p. 32, September 23, 1915. Quote: John D. Jr. gay at mine dance, *New York Press*, September 24, 1915. Welfare Work – Bandstands, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, box 17, folder 149, RAC.

³² King, Colorado Diary, op. cit., pp. 707-709.

³³ Welfare Work – Churches, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, box 17, folders 152-155. RAC.

³⁴ Discussions: Mackenzie King, Colorado Diary, op. cit., pp. 214, 215; 707-708. Bell towers advice: King to JDR Jr., April 13, 1916.

³⁵ JDR Jr. to Jesse F. Welborn memorandum, October 13, 1915, Jesse F. Welborn Papers, box 1, folder 17, History Colorado Archives (Colorado Historical Society), Denver. The accompanying letter suggested the memo be destroyed or put somewhere it would not be accessible.

³⁶ Rockefeller was enthusiastic about Corwin's work and Corwin corresponded about his medical activities until about 1920. Colorado Fuel & Iron --Dr. Corwin, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, box 14, folder 116; also, box 17, folder 144, RAC. One researcher implies that Corwin wanted to request financial support for research and was directed to the Rockefeller Institute for Medical Research: Robin C. Henry, "In order to form a more perfect worker," Fawn-Amber Montoya (Ed.), *Making an American Workforce. The Rockefellers and the Legacy of Ludlow*, 81-101 at 92-93. Boulder, CO: University Press of Colorado, 2014. See also Rockefeller University (RIMR) Records, Business Manager Correspondence, Series 2, box 1.

³⁷ Charles O. Heydt Memo, op. cit. pp. 4, 18, 22, 35, RAC. "Hospitals at mining camps, *CF&I Industrial Bulletin*, vol. 1, no. 4, p. 4, April 12, 1916. Welfare Work – Dispensaries, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, box 17, folders 147, 147A, 151.

³⁸ 1919-1920 Industrial Conferences: Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Economic Reform Interests, Series F, boxes 14-15, folders 111-119, RAC. U.S. Senate Committee on Education and Labor, *The Report of the Industrial Conference*. Washington, DC: U.S. Government Printing Office. 1920.

³⁹ Sherman Rogers, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Friends and Services, Series H, box 155, folders 122-123, RAC. Earlier, JDR Jr. also had contributed \$300 directly to Rogers toward the publication of a bylined article in a prominent newsweekly, *The Outlook*.

⁴⁰ National Bureau of Economic Research, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, box 18, folder 143, RAC.

⁴¹ Bureau of Personnel Administration: box 12, folder 96; National Industrial Conference Board: box 13, folder 144; Loyal Legion of Loggers and Lumbermen: box 13, folder 104, all Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, RAC.

⁴² Industrial Relations Counselors. Raymond A. Fosdick, *John D. Rockefeller, Jr., A Portrait*, pp. 217-225. Records: Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Economic Reform Interests, Series F, box 17, folders 132-138. Bruce E. Kaufman, "Industrial Relations Counselors, Inc." Its history and significance. In Bruce E. Kaufman, Richard A. Beaumont & Roy B. Helfgott (eds.), *Industrial Relations to Human Resources and Beyond: The Evolving Process of Employee Relations Management*, pp. 31-114. Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe, 2003.

⁴³ Special Conference Committee: Sanford M., *Employing Bureaucracy. Managers, Unions, and the Transformation of Work in American Industry, 1900-1945*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1985 pp. 180-182. Sanford M. Jacoby, "A Century of Human Resource Management," in Bruce E. Kaufman, Richard A. Beaumont & Roy B. Helfgott (Eds.), *Industrial Relations... op. cit.*, pp. 147-171, esp. at 152-154. Howard M. Gitelman, *Legacy of the Ludlow Massacre*, op. cit., pp. 288, 334-335. JDR Jr. had met Cowdrick in Colorado, where he had been an Associated Press reporter, later becoming editor of the *CF&I Industrial Bulletin*. The appointment allowed him to write two books on labor issues in the 1920s See Edward Cowdrick, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, box 14, folder 117, RAC.

⁴⁴ Samuel Gompers, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Economic Reforms Interests, Series F, box 13, folder 97; Portrait: Robert W. Gumbel to Ralph N. Easley, July 21, 1921. Memoirs: Matthew Woll to JDR Jr. February 21, 1922, JDR Jr. to Woll, February 24, 1924, JDR Jr. to Woll, May 27, 1943, RAC.

⁴⁵ Study of Industry Relations, Rockefeller Foundation Records, record group 3, series 900, box 20, folder 151, RAC. See also William Lyon Mackenzie King, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller Friends and Services, Series H, box 71, folder 547, RAC. Book: William Lyon Mackenzie King, *Industry and Humanity*. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1918. The volume proved a disappointment to JDR Jr. and the Foundation's trustees for its verbosity and lack of practical, actionable recommendations and was published commercially instead of under the Foundation's imprint.

⁴⁶ George Blessing, Robert Foerster, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Friends and Services, Series H, box 48, folder 353; box 117 folder 864, respectively, RAC. A.H. Lichty – Reports on Companies, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Economic Reforms Interests, Series F, box 15, folders 124-126, RAC.

⁴⁷ Princeton: Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Education Interests, Series G, box 80, folders 570-570C, RAC.

⁴⁸ Elton Mayo at Wharton: Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Education Interests Series G, box 117, folder 864; Laura Spelman Rockefeller Memorial Records, series 1, box 5, folder 49, RAC.

⁴⁹ Elton Mayo at Harvard: Laura Spelman Rockefeller Memorial records, series 1, box 53, folder 572. Richard C.S. Trahair, *The Humanist Temper: The Life and World of Elton Mayo*. New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Books, pp. 181-211. In 1928, prior to joining the Harvard faculty, Mayo met with JDR Jr. and was retained by IRC to study employee conditions at CF&I following the 1927-1928 Coal Strike: Elton Mayo Papers, series 1 box B3b, folder 19; box 1c, folders 78-79, both Baker Library, Harvard School of Business Administration.

⁵⁰ Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Economic Reform Interests, Series F, box 16, folder 131-132; box 55, folder 391; box 92, folder 635, all RAC.

⁵¹ United States Commission on Industrial Relations. *Final Report and Testimony ...*, op. cit, vol. 8, pp. 7427-7759 and 7763-7895.

⁵² Raymond B. Fosdick, *The Story of the Rockefeller Foundation*, New York: Harper, 1952, pp. 26-28. Richard Magat, *Unlikely Partners; Philanthropic Foundations and the Labor Movement*. Ithaca: NY: ILR Press/Cornell University Press, 1989, pp. 41-46. The Smith-Lever Act of 1914 banned federal government collaboration with philanthropies and placed the management of agricultural extension programs (such as General Education Board's demonstration projects) in the hands of the state land-grant colleges. The Smith-Hughes Act of 1917 provided federal funding to train teachers of vocational agriculture and home economics, another GEB program. See Raymond Fosdick, *Adventure in Giving: The Story of the General Education Board, A Foundation Established by John D. Rockefeller*. New York: Harper & Row, 1962, pp. 59-60.

⁵³ The author argues that philanthropy can be conceptualized in a variety of other ways that include but are not limited to: *philanthropy as mission* (fulfilling an organizational purpose), *philanthropy as observance* (marking an historical milestone), *philanthropy as recognition* (honoring personal or organizational accomplishments), and *philanthropy as remembrance* (honoring the deceased). Such categorizations are not assumed to be mutually exclusive.

⁵⁴ For an example, see Starr J. Murphy to JDR Jr., February 16. 1911, American Association for Labor Legislation, op. cit.

⁵⁵ See Fosdick, *John D. Rockefeller, Jr., A Portrait*, op. cit.: Road-building in national parks, p. 304; church construction and preservation, pp. 221-223; Riverside Church carillon, p. 223; The Cloisters, p. 336-345; places for communities to gather: Williamsburg, pp. 272-301, USO clubs, p. 408-409, Rockefeller Center, p. 262-327; later medical philanthropies, p. 360-387.

⁵⁶ JDR Jr. had been the subject of unavoidable publicity since his wedding in 1902 and never sought out attention for himself. He was surprised and would have preferred no reporters

accompanied him on his Colorado trip in 1915. In the 1920s the focus of proactive publicity efforts by the family was to cultivate a favorable image of JDR Sr. through articles and newsreels. The only extant example of CF&I touting JDR Jr.'s gifts was a news release about the opening of the Berwin church in May 1917. Charles Hicks wrote JDR Jr., "It seems to me this piece of publicity work has been of real value in bringing before the public news as to the very important development in the CF&I camps:" Hicks to JDR Jr., May 19, 1917, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, box 17 , folder 147A, RAC.

⁵⁷ JDR Jr. to Clarence J. Hicks, February 10, 1916, Office of the Messrs. Rockefeller, Business Interests, Series C, box 17, folder 147A, RAC